



Member Site Visit Meeting

10th November 2022

Weather conditions: Mostly dry, windy with a hint of mizzle.

Planning Committee Member Attendance:

Councillors:			
AWFORD, Cllr Philip	P	MACKENZIE-CHARRINGTON, Cllr Mark*	P
BAKER, Cllr Paul	AP	MCFARLING, Cllr Chris	P
BROWN, Cllr David	Ap	MORGAN, Cllr Graham	P
FISHER, Cllr Bernard	Ap	MOSELEY, Cllr Gill	P
HALE, Cllr Terry**	P	NELSON, Cllr Emma	P
HARMAN, Cllr Tim	Ap	TRACEY, Cllr Pamela	P
HEGENBARTH, Cllr Alex	Ap	VINES, Cllr Robert	P
		Williams, Cllr Sue	Ap

Chairperson* Vice Chairperson **

Key: P=present, Ab=absent, Ap= Apologies

Officers in attendance:

Sarah Pearse, (SP) Principal Planning Officer, Kevin Phillips, (KP) Team Manager, Marcus Sparrow (SP), Senior Planning Officer (Case Officer), and Carrie Denness (CD), Principal Lawyer.

Members were joined on site by Mr Ahmet Donmez, the Puckrup Hall Hotel General Manager, Mr Luckett representing Twynning Parish Council, Mr David and Mr Phillip Martineau representing the adjacent Church End Nursery, Mr Nick Warner from the closest residence and Ms Nikki Reeves representing the Action group REACT.

Members were also joined by approximately 50 Members of the REACT Action group who made a peaceful protest about the proposal.

Planning application 19/0081/TWMAJM for a proposed new vehicular access off A38, plus haul road, weighbridge/office, processing plant and equipment (including concrete batching plant), creation of clean water ponds, silt ponds, stock piles and other works and ancillary development associated with the extraction of sand and gravel and import of inert materials with restoration using site derived material to wetlands, nature conservation and agriculture (cross-boundary application with

Worcestershire) by Mr Moreton Cullimore on land at Bow Farm, Bow Lane, Twyning, Tewkesbury, Gloucestershire.

The Members of the MSV stood in the grounds of the Puckrup Golf Club to view the site where Case Officer described the site and the proposal – (see Appendix 1 attached Officer Briefing Notes.) highlighting relevant site features.

At the request of Cllr McFarling, the Case Officer pointed out the site boundary within the landscape with reference to the site location plan. Members noted the direction of the wind which was coming from the direction of the proposed mineral processing plant site.

After this brief presentation, members moved inside the Golf Club building for the remainder of the presentation. At this point Mr Donmez introduced himself and explained that the hotel had an associated health club and golf club. He explained that in the course of a year with seasonal variations there were approximately 200 employees at the complex. He explained that guests expect a peaceful, silent stay and don't want a quarry. The associated noise, dust and traffic will have an impact and customers will be lost. This could lead to the business becoming unviable and closing.

Member Questions:

Following the case officer presentation identifying that parts of the site were in different flood zones, Cllr MacKenzie-Charrington asked the case officer to explain the differences between flood zones. The case officer (CO) explained that flood zones are a guidance tool, formed by the Environment Agency, to demonstrate the probability of river and sea flooding in areas across England. Flood zone 1 has a low probability of flooding, flood zone 2 has a medium probability and flood zone 3a has a high probability, with 3b forming the functional flood plain.

Cllr McFarling asked whether the fields under the control of the operator would all go and if inert material would be brought onto site for restoration. The CO explained that the top soil and overburden will be removed and stored on site, for use in restoration. He confirmed that inert material would be brought in to restore the site to existing or near existing levels.

The CO explained that the majority of the mineral extraction area lies with Worcestershire, who approved their application at their planning committee on 31st October, subject to this current GCC application for access arrangements and plant area being determined favourably.

Cllr McFarling asked if both counties would be responsible for enforcement at the joint site? The CO answered yes and also for monitoring. As for dealing with the applications there will be cross boundary co-operation.

Cllr McFarling asked about the bund and acoustic fence, will it be possible to see over it into the site from the Gloucestershire side? Will noise go over the 1 m high acoustic fence?

The CO explained that the acoustic fence will sit on top of a 3m high bund around the plant site. There is a 16 m height difference between the extraction site and the access point on the A38. He pointed out that the tops of the glass houses at the adjacent Church End Nursery can be seen above intervening vegetation, from the Golf Course.

Cllr Tracey asked if there was any change of traffic lights at the junction of the access track with the A38 as it is a busy road? The CO explained that that does not form part of the application, and it is not a requirement of the Highway Authority. There will however be a traffic filter lane.

Cllr Tracey asked if the bridleway would be fenced off? The CO stated that the advice of the British Horse Society had been sought and there will be a 1.4m high fence which is shown on the application plans.

Cllr Tracey asked if the stables mentioned were working. The CO confirmed that they were.

Cllr Tracey asked about the “feedstock” mentioned in the presentation. The CO confirmed that he was referring to the sand and gravel extracted from the site which will be used in the batching plant.

Cllr Tracey asked about the railway line that was mentioned in the presentation. The CO pointed out that this was a disused and dismantled railway that is now a mature hedge.

Cllr Morgan asked about the processing plant location. The CO explained that the haul road would be on the Puckrup Hall side of the glass houses and illustrated this using a plan.

Cllr Hale asked about the sediment ponds. The CO explained that they would be 9 metres deep, but would gradually silt up over time. Water would be recycled from the ponds after sediment had settled out.

The Twyning Parish Council representative was invited to speak. He thanked the CO for a very comprehensive briefing. He was aware of the limitations about speaking at MSV and would explain the Parish Council Objection at the Planning Committee meeting.

The Church End Nursery representative was invited to speak, but declined.

Mr Warner, the resident at Gardeners Cottage was invited to speak. He commended the CO presentation and highlighted the direction of the prevailing wind with reference to noise and dust.

The Action group representative was invited to speak, but said she would make comments at the planning committee.

MSV ended at 12.00

Members of the MSV moved to view the mineral extraction application site from a vantage point near the M50 and Bow Farm. The extent of the site was pointed out to members on a plan and in the field. Whilst travelling along Bow Lane the CO pointed out Cemex's proposed mineral site north of the M50 motorway, along with Towbury Hillfort, Puck Cottage and Padsview Stables.



Member Site Visit Meeting

Date: Thursday 10th November 2022

Officer Briefing Notes:

The planning application to which this site visit relates is for 'proposed new vehicular access off the A38, plus the installation of a haul road, weighbridge/office, processing plant and equipment (including concrete batching plant), creation of clean water ponds, silt ponds, stock piles and other works and ancillary development associated with the extraction of sand and gravel and import of inert materials with restoration using site derived material to wetlands, nature conservation and agriculture.

The application site is within the borough of Tewkesbury and the parish of Twyning. The Bow Farm application site covers an area of approximately 65 hectares. The site straddles the administrative boundaries of both Gloucestershire (9.1 hectares) and Worcestershire (55.9 hectares) and the site is in the sole ownership of Moreton C Cullimore (Gravels) Ltd.

(show Location Plan)

The Site is located about 1.3 kilometres west of junction 1 of the M50 Motorway and about 3.6 kilometres south-west of junction 8 of the M5 Motorway. The village of Twyning is located approximately 895 metres north-east of the application site red line boundary (about 1.7 kilometres north-east of the extraction area); the village of Ripple is situated about 550 metres north of the proposal on the northern side of the M50 Motorway; the village of Church End is located approximately 310 metres east of the application site red line boundary (about 1.2 kilometres east of the extraction area); and the town of Tewkesbury is located approximately 3.1 kilometres south-east of the site.

The Site is currently in agricultural use and is comprised of several field parcels that are separated by internal boundaries that lie in the open countryside of south Worcestershire, within Malvern Hills District, and north Gloucestershire, within Tewkesbury Borough. The neighbouring land uses are dominated by agricultural activities such as the large greenhouses at Church End Nursery, the northern most corner of which is located approximately 54m to the south of the proposed haul route that would serve the Site. Land immediately north of the Site consists of the grounds to Hilton Puckrup Hall Hotel & Golf Club.

(show Plant Site Details drawing and point out Church End Nursery and golf course)

The land edged red (application site) on the Site Location drawing includes approximately 0.29 hectares of registered Common Land in Gloucestershire.

Twyning Bridleway 37 (Bridleway ATW37) within Gloucestershire crosses the proposed haul road north to south. Twyning Footpath 34 (Footpath ATW34) also within Gloucestershire runs west to east from Puckrup Lane to the A38, to the north of the application site.

(show Proposed Bridleway Crossing Detail drawing)

The topography of the Site in Gloucestershire slopes downwards east to west across the Site. The proposed access onto the A38 at the Site's most easterly point has a ground surface contour of 34m Above Ordnance Datum. To the far west of the Site, in Gloucestershire, the western edge of the proposed clean water pond would have a ground surface contour of 11m Above Ordnance Datum. The topography of the area of land proposed for the processing plant site is at approximately 15 metres to 16 metres Above Ordnance Datum.

An underground Exolum Pipeline System oil pipeline and Defence Infrastructure Organisation redundant oil pipeline run north to south through the application site on land between the proposed processing plant site and the access onto the A38 in Gloucestershire. The pipelines are located outside the proposed extraction boundary.

(show Proposed Pipeline Crossing drawing)

Whilst there are no residential properties within the red line of the application site, the site is in close proximity to a number of residential properties. The nearest residential property to the red line boundary within Gloucestershire is Fairfield, an occupied detached bungalow in the ownership of the applicant, the boundary of which is sited approx. 11m north of the proposed haul road near the proposed access onto the A38. Bow Farm Farmhouse, which is also owned by the applicant, lies approximately 689 metres to the north-west of the proposed screening and washing plant and 780 metres from the proposed concrete batching plant.

A number of residential properties front onto Bow Lane in Worcestershire to the north-west of the proposed plant site area, these include:

- Puck Cottage: approximately 50 metres east of the application boundary (in Worcestershire), 1.03km from the proposed screening and washing plant, and 1.08km from the proposed concrete batching plant.
- The Threshing Bow: approximately 60 metres east of the application boundary (in Worcestershire), 1km from the proposed screening and washing plant and 1.05km from the proposed concrete batching plant.

- Bow Cottage: approximately 80 metres east of the application boundary (in Worcestershire), 960 metres from the proposed screening and washing plant and 1km from the proposed concrete batching plant.
- Bowfields: approximately 55 metres east of the application boundary (in Worcestershire), 868 metres from the proposed screening and washing plant and 924 metres from the proposed concrete batching plant.

On Puckrup Lane in Gloucestershire to the north-west of the proposed plant site area are the following residential properties:

- Dadsley Cottage: approximately 200 metres east of the proposal in Worcestershire, 473 metres from the proposed screening and washing plant and 522 metres from the proposed concrete batching plant.
- Bowbridge Cottage: approximately 260 metres east of the proposal in Worcestershire, 502 metres from the proposed screening and washing plant and 541 metres from the proposed concrete batching plant.

Accessed off Puckrup Lane in Gloucestershire and sited north of the proposed plant site area are a number of residential properties, including:

- The Cider House: approximately 536 metres from the proposed screening and washing plant, 470 metres from the proposed concrete batching plant and 689 metres north-east of the application boundary in Worcestershire.
- Puckrup Hall Farm Cottages: approximately 513 metres from the proposed screening and washing plant, 441 metres from the proposed concrete batching plant and 693 metres north-east of the application boundary in Worcestershire.
- Gardners Cottage: approximately 452 metres from the proposed screening and washing plant, 376 metres from the proposed concrete batching plant and 681 metres north-east of the application boundary in Worcestershire.

Accessed off the A38 (Gloucestershire) and sited to the east of the proposed plant site area, the closest residential properties, include:

- Far End: approximately 317 metres from the proposed screening and washing plant, 213 metres from the proposed concrete batching plant and 771 metres east of the application boundary in Worcestershire. The middle of the proposed site access off the A38 would be approximately 197 metres to the north-east of Far End.
- A cluster of residential properties are located on the east side of the A38, approximately 218 metres south of the proposed Site access. These properties are sited between 492 metres and 507 metres from the proposed screening and washing plant and between 400 metres and 427 metres from the proposed concrete batching plant.

To the south of the proposed concrete haul route adjoining the A38 and south-east of proposed 'Silt Pond 1', the nearest residential properties are:

- Twyning Farmhouse: approximately 421 metres from the proposed screening and washing plant, 453 metres from the proposed concrete batching plant and 810 metres south-east of the application boundary in Worcestershire.
- Rose Bank: approximately 561 metres from the proposed screening and washing plant, 556 metres from the proposed concrete batching plant and 992 metres south-east of the application boundary in Worcestershire.
- Le Bourg des Templiers: approximately 423 metres from the proposed screening and washing plant, 481 metres from the proposed concrete batching plant and 777 metres south-east of the application boundary in Worcestershire.
- Owl's End: approximately 470 metres from the proposed screening and washing plant, 551 metres from the proposed concrete batching plant and 764 metres south-east of the application boundary in Worcestershire.

Approximately 411 metres south of the Site boundary adjoining 'Silt Pond 1' is the property known as Redpools Farm, which is approximately 606 metres from the proposed screening and washing plant, 717 metres from the proposed concrete batching plant and 750 metres south-east of the application boundary in Worcestershire.

With the exception of surrounding farmland, there are multiple commercial properties/developments within the vicinity of the application boundary, the most notable of which are:

- Hilton Puckrup Hall Hotel & Golf Club in Gloucestershire: approximately 455 metres from the proposed screening and washing plant, 364 metres from the proposed concrete batching plant and 740 metres from the application boundary in Worcestershire.
- Church End Nursery in Gloucestershire: the northern most corner of the greenhouses is located approximately 54m to the south of the proposed section of concrete haul route that would serve the Site off the A38.
- Sunset View Park in Gloucestershire: the entrance to this established holiday home development is approximately 661 metres south-east of the proposed screening and washing plant, 608 metres south-east of the proposed concrete batching plant and 1.1km from the application boundary in Worcestershire.
- Dawleys Caravan Park in Gloucestershire: the entrance to which is approximately 764 metres south of the proposed screening and washing plant, 880 metres south-west of the proposed concrete batching plant and 910 metres from the application boundary in Worcestershire.
- Curtilage of land at Padsview Stables, Bow Lane, in Worcestershire: approximately 586 metres north-west of the proposed screening and washing plant, 650 metres north-west of the proposed concrete batching plant and 45 metres east of the proposed extraction area in Worcestershire.

(point out residential properties on 'Phases 3 and 4 Extraction' drawing)

The Site area west of the 'Dismantled Railway' line falls within Flood Zone 2 and 3 of the Environment Agency fluvial flood risk map. The Site east of the 'Dismantled Railway' line that includes the processing plant area is within Flood Zone 1.

(show line of dismantled railway on 'Phases 3 and 4 Extraction' drawing)

The application site comprises Grades 2 and 3 agricultural land and, therefore, comprises, in part, Best and Most Versatile agricultural land.

Bredon Hill which forms part of the Cotswolds Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty National Landscape is located about 4.3 kilometres east of the application site and is also designated in part as a Special Area of Conservation and National Nature Reserve. The Malvern Hills AONB National Landscape is located about 7.6 kilometres broadly to the west of the proposed extraction area. Dixon Wood Special Area of Conservation is located approximately 9.8 kilometres broadly south-east of the application site.

There are a number of statutory and non-statutory wildlife designated sites within 3 kilometres of the proposal.

The application site is hydrologically linked to the Severn Estuary Special Protection Area and Special Area of Conservation which are European designated sites.

At approximately 747 metres north-north-west of the boundary to the proposed plant area is Towbury Hill camp, which is the nearest Scheduled Ancient Monument.

(show Towbury Hillfort SAM Cross Sections drawing)

There are a number of Listed Buildings within the vicinity of the application site, this includes the Grade II Listed Building of Puck Cottage which is located approximately 50 metres east of the application site (extraction area). The Grade II Listed Buildings of Bow Bridge Cottage and Barn (circa 10 metres north-east of Bow Bridge Cottage) are located on Puckrup Lane approximately 250 metres to the east of the application site. Six further Grade II Listed Buildings (Barn, Barn and Pigsties, Stable Block, Puckrup Farmhouse, The Bothy, and Puckrup Hall) are situated about 680 metres east of the extraction area and 350 metres north of the proposed access haul road onto the A38 at their closest point. The Grade II Listed Building of Twyning Farm including Walled Garden and Dairy is located approximately 310 metres south of the application site and approximately 810 metres south-east of the proposed extraction area. Further Grade II Listed Buildings (Shuthonger Villa, Shuthonger House, boundary wall, gates and gate piers to Shuthonger House and Crown Cottage) are located beyond in Hamlet of Shuthonger. A number of Listed Buildings are located within the village of Church End including the Grade II* Church of St Mary Magdalene located about 1.4 kilometres east of the proposed extraction area and 510 metres from the

application site. Further Listed Buildings are located on the western bank of the River Severn including the Grade II* Listed Buildings of Church of Saint Nicholas and Pull Court, Screen, Archway and Gates located approximately 1.1 kilometre north-west and 760 metres west of the application site, respectively.

Church End Conservation Area is located approximately 320 metres east of the application site.

Following the retention of all veteran trees across the site, the estimated mineral yield of approximately 1.5 million tonnes was reduced to approximately 1.44 million tonnes.

(show Tree Protection Plan)

Only approximately 40,000 tonnes of mineral extraction would take place in Gloucestershire, which would be derived from the creation of the proposed silt and clean water lagoons. These lagoons would be surrounded by a soil bund measuring approximately 1 metre in height and post and rail fence measuring approximately 1.2 metres high where they boarder Bridleway ATW37. A post and rail fence measuring approximately 1.4 metres high would run along the eastern boundary of the proposed haul route, for the safety of users of the bridleway.

(point out silt pond and clean water ponds on Plant Site Details drawing)

The maximum depth of extraction in Gloucestershire would be 9.5 metres to create the silt lagoons and 7.5 metres in Worcestershire. It is estimated that the Site would be exhausted of mineral and restored within 9 years of the commencement of the development. The applicant states that this 9-year period can be subdivided into the following activities: the extraction is anticipated to take between 6.5 to 7 years. Site set up and mobilisation is expected to take approximately 3 to 6 months. To complete infilling / restoration is anticipated to take 1 year and a margin of error of 6 to 9 months to allow for market fluctuations, and delays to site operations due to climatic conditions.

(show Proposed Restoration drawing)

The Site would be progressively restored using a combination of site derived soils, overburden and imported inert waste material. The application submission defines imported inert waste as *“including uncontaminated or treated sub-soils, as well as construction, demolition and excavation waste such as, but not limited to concrete; bricks; tiles; and ceramics that will not undergo any physical, chemical or biological transformations of significance and will not give rise to environmental pollution or risk harm to human health as a result of coming into contact with other matter”*.

Approximately 1.4 million tonnes of inert waste material would be required to return the proposed linear Phases 1 to 9 in Worcestershire back to pre-extraction

levels. The estimated annual rate of disposal would be about 165,222 tonnes per year.

The applicant states that compared to the current baseline, the proposed restoration scheme would result in the replacement of over 25 hectares of lower-grade agricultural land with biodiversity and nature conservation gain.

The applicant states that approximately 55% to 60% of the extracted sand and 40% to 50% of extracted gravel would be used as feedstock in the proposed onsite concrete batching plant.

(show 'Plant Site Elevations' drawing and highlight dimensions of plant)

It is estimated that the proposal would generate approximately 144 HGV movements per day (72 HGVs entering the site and 72 exiting the site per day), equalling approximately 13 two-way HGV movements per hour, or approximately 1 HGV movement in either direction every 5 minutes during a weekday. It is estimated that staff vehicular movements to and from the proposed development would be a worst-case scenario of approximately 40 vehicle movements per day (20 vehicles entering the site and 20 vehicles exiting the site per day).

With regard to internal dump truck movements, the applicant estimates that there would be approximately 50 internal dump truck movements per day within the site. Material would be transported between the proposed extraction and processing plant areas along the connecting haul road using 2 dump trucks operating rotationally. The haul route would be constructed from Ministry of Transport Type 1 material, which is a crushed gravel no larger than 40mm, which would be located between the proposed processing plant site in Gloucestershire and Phase 9 of the extraction area located in Worcestershire. An internal access spanning approximately 300 metres by 7.3 metres wide and constructed from concrete would be constructed between the proposed processing plant site area and the A38 junction, lined by a grassed bund measuring approximately 1 metre high to mitigate noise and dust impacts resulting from HGV movements.

The applicant has confirmed that imported inert material would be stockpiled within the plant site area and transported for deposit within the extraction area by dump truck.

Visibility splays measuring approximately 4.5 metres by 160 metres in each direction are proposed, and to achieve this, trees on the boundary frontage with the A38 would be removed and the hedgerow managed to a level of no more than 0.6 metres high.

A wheel washing facility would be provided within the proposed processing plant area in Gloucestershire to service HGVs when exiting from the proposed processing plant site. Water would be sourced from the proposed clean water lagoon to feed the facility.

(show 'Plant Site Details' drawing and point out wheel washing, sheeting area, weighbridge office, welfare office and store)

It is proposed that the operating hours associated with the mineral extraction, processing and import / export of material would be between 07:00 to 18:00 hours Mondays to Fridays; 07:00 to 13:00 hours Saturdays; and no working on Sundays, Public or Bank Holidays.

That concludes my presentation.

The End